Comments for the RADBUG 2019 *Truss Analysis LFR & LRFR* presentation

Slide 8:

LFR and LRFR LL forces are the same. Force effects are the same because impact, distribution factor and scale factors are applied later in the analysis before specification checking.

Slide 15:

DL factor is not applied to preload for counter analysis. This behavior is correct to avoid a case where dead load increases the member capacity when live load causes opposite stress. Method of Solution needs updated (BSSD-1105).

Slide 20:

LRFR also does not need to apply impact since the counter analysis with and without impact do not change the actions. BSSD-1103 will cover this fix.

Slide 23:

This is enhancement request BSSD-1581 for treating net area differently between LFR and LRFR.

Slide 25:

This is also covered in BSSD-1581 to use effective area as per Std 10.18.4.

Slide 31:

Enhancement request: Consider combined tension and flexure for LFR.

Slide 33:

Enhancement request: Truss LRFR with adjacent vehicle.

Slide 37:

BrR includes effect of flexure when calculating rating as per MBE 6A.6.8 Combined Axial Compression and Flexure. Including flexure in rating is based on non-zero My or Mz which can be seen from the second load case (second row) shown on the slide. Both My and Mz moments for the first load case (first row) shown on the slide are zero, hence the note appears below the table for the "Note" column.

Truss Analysis LFR and LRFR

Elizabeth Befikadu, PE AI Engineers July 30, 2019

Truss LFR/LRFR

- **Force Effect**
- **Capacity**
- **-** Rating
- Conclusion

Purpose:

- Show users what is available in BrR
- **Discrepancies**
- **Deviation**
- Creating Dialogue for discussion to come up with solution.

BrR/BrDR

- Version 6.8.4 Beta 4
- Version 7.0 Beta 3

Influence line: Truss without counters

- Sample Truss 8 Panels @ 12.25 ft
- Type 3 vehicle
- $BC1$
- Unit load will be applied at each panel point

Influence Line: Linear Analysis LFR & LRFR

Method of Loading on Influence line

- Positioning the axle over the peaks.
- Placing the CG of the vehicle at the peak.
- Vehicle moves from right to left and vice versa.

Load at the peak, First Axle at 31.25 ft

First axle at 31.25 ft Axial Force=17*0.487+17*0.464+16*0.379=22.23k

Total Action: Max 22.2472 kip Min 22.2472 kip Vehicle moving left to right. Position of first axle = 31.250 ft

Force Effect IL

CG of axles @ Peak

Force effect for both LFR & LRFR method are the same.

C.G @ peak 11.56 ft Axial Force=17*0.191+17*0.35+16*0.422=15.95k

Position 4 -- CG [11.560 ft] at peak -- \sim \sim \sim

Total Action: Max 15.9535 kip Min 15.9535 kip Vehicle moving left to right. Position of first axle = 23.810 ft

Method of Solution

1.4 LIVE LOAD ANALYSIS OF A LONGITUDINAL TRUSS WITH **COUNTERS**

LFR

Truck Loading 1.4.1.1

- 1. All dead load cases are summed up and multiplied by dead load factor as one pre-load load case.
- 2. Multiple live load cases are generated by placing truck axle loads at locations on the truss. Each live load case is multiplied by live load factor and distribution factor. Pre-load dead load case is added to each live load case. When adjacent vehicle is included in the analysis, the primary truck axles will be superimposed with the adjacent truck axles at the center of gravity location.

LRFR

1.4.1.1 Truck Loading

- 1. Dead load (DC) cases are summed up and multiplied by dead load factor (DC) as the first load case.
- 2. Dead load (DW) cases are summed up and multiplied by dead load factor (DW) and then summed up with factored DC load case above as one pre-load load case.
- 3. Multiple live load cases are generated by placing truck axle loads at locations on the truss. Each live load case is multiplied by live load factor, scale factor, dynamic load allowance and distribution factor. Pre-load dead load case is added to each live load case. Perform non-linear analyses for pre-load load case and all live load cases.

Non-Linear Analysis: Background

- **Background**
- BrR

 $\Sigma M_H=0$ $10R_H = 4(30) + 3(60) + 6(60) + 14(20)$ $R_H=94$ kN

 $\Sigma F_V=0$ F_{BE} sin 45° + 20 = 94 $F_{BE} = 74\sqrt{2}$ kN = 104.65 kN tension

Non-Linear Analysis: BrR/BrDR

Sample Truss 10 @ 23ft

- Type 3 vehicle
- Type 3-Inventory Level
- Member 1 & Member 11

Live Load Distribution Factor

LFR

- **Lever Rule**
- **MPF**

LRFR

- **Lever Rule**
- **MPF**

LRFD Multiple Presence Factor (MPF)

AASHTO 3.6.1.1.2-1)	
# of Lane	MPF
	1.2
	0.85
	0.65

Impact Factor

LFR

AASHTO Standard 3.8.2, for the loaded length L.

3.8.2 Impact Formula

3.8.2.1 The amount of the impact allowance or increment is expressed as a fraction of the live load stress, and shall be determined by the formula:

$$
I = \frac{50}{L + 125} . \tag{3-1}
$$

in which,

 $I =$ impact fraction (maximum 30 percent);

 $L =$ length in feet of the portion of the span that is loaded to produce the maximum stress in the member.

LRFR

AASHTO LRFD Table 3.6.2.1-1

Table 3.6.2.1-1-Dynamic Load Allowance, IM

Type 3

 $-4.00'$

- LFR=Axle*LF*LLDF
- LRFR=Axle*LF*LLDF*I

 $-15,00'$

17*0.81*1.45*1.33=26.6K 16*0.81*1.45*1.33=25.0K (LRFR) 17*0.68*2.17=25.1K 16*0.68*2.17=23.6K (LFR-INV) 16K Type 3 17K 17K

LFR Axle load does not include Impact.

 $2...$

Force effect: Preload Dead load

LFR

DC Node X Y $10.0000.00$ 3 23.00 0.00

4 46.00 0.00 7 69.00 0.00 8 92.00 0.00 10 115.00 0.00 13 138.00 0.00 16 161.00 0.00 17 184.00 0.00 20 207.00 0.00 21 230.00 0.00 Adding Preload load case as LC 1... Node = 1 Load = -18.90 Node = 2 Load = -5.67 Node = 3 Load = -32.77 Node = 4 Load = -34.03 Node = 5 Load = -5.56 Node = 6 Load = -5.59 Node = 7 Load = -35.20 Node = 8 Load = -35.27 Node = 9 Load = -6.01 Node = 10 Load = -34.04 Node = 11 Load = -4.84 Node = 12 Load = -2.41 Node = 13 Load = -35.27 Node = 14 Load = -6.01 Node = 15 Load = -5.59 Node = 16 Load = -35.20 Node = 17 Load = -34.03 Node = 18 Load = -5.56 Node = 19 Load = -5.67 Node = 20 Load = -32.77 Node = 21 Load = -18.90

• **DL values are not factored by DL factor as opposed to method of solution.**

LRFR DC1+DC2 DC1Spec LL factor = 1.93=1.45*1.33

Sample Truss-Non-Linear analysis

 $Node = 1$

 $Node = 1$

Force effect: Preload Dead Load-Mem 1 & 11 LFR: DL LRFR: DL

Mem11sin48.504=R=199.64-18.9=180.74kip Mem11=241.3kip

Mem11cos48.504=Mem1 Mem1=159.9kip

2 Preload DC + DW Load Case

Preload consists Dead Load acti the Live Load is applied.

Element Axial Eonce 159,890 $\mathbf{1}$ $\overline{2}$ 159.890 R 225,159 \overline{a} 288.024 320.493 5 6 320,493 $\overline{7}$ 288,024 \mathbf{R} 225,159 $\overline{9}$ 159.890 10 159.890 11 -241.316

Mem11sin48.504=R=199.64-18.9=180.74kip Mem11=241.3kip

Mem11cos48.504=Mem1 Mem1=159.9kip

Critical LL: First axle @ X=42 ft

LRFR

Mem11sin48.504=R=267.51-18.9=248.61kip Mem11=331.92kip

Mem11cos48.504=Mem1 Mem1=219.92kip

Live Load=Total-Preload Mem1=219.92-159.9=60.02kip Mem11=-331.92-(-241.3)=-90.62kip

Load Case 9 Load Case 9

First

Critical LL: First axle @ X=42 ft

LFR : No Impact

Mem11sin48.504=R=263.37-18.9=244.47kip Mem11=326.39kip

Mem11cos48.504=Mem1 Mem1=216.26kip

Live Load=Total-Preload

Mem1=216.26-159.9=56.36kip Mem11=-326.39-(-241.3)=-85.1kip

Live Load=Total-Preload Mem1=224.18-159.9=64.28kip Mem11=-338.33-(-241.3)=-97.03kip

LL LFD Preload without Impact

Live Load=Total-Preload Mem1=216.26-159.9=56.36kip Mem11=-326.39-(-241.3)=-85.1kip

LFR LL Impact with preload

Impact I=1.14

Live Load=Total-Preload Mem1=224.18-159.9=64.28kip Mem11=-338.33-(-241.3)=-97.03kip

Mem1=LL(1+I)/(1+I)=64.28/1.14=56.39kip Mem11=LL(1+I)/(1+I)=-97.03/1.14=85.1kip

• **Including impact values with preload or during rating analysis does not make a difference.** • **Why include impact for LRFR?**

Section Property

LFR

- **Non-Detail**
- **Exercise Standard Section**

LRFR

■ Standard Section

If Non-Detail no rating or specification check.

Net and Effective Area

LFR

- According to AASHTO Standard Article 10.18.4
- Section 1.7 AASHTO 1985

Tension Members 10.18.4

$$
A_e = A_n + \beta A_g \le A_g \tag{10-4w}
$$

where:

- A_n = net section of the member computed as specified in Article 10.16.14
- β = 0.0 for AASHTO M 270 Grade 100/100W (ASTM A 709 Grade 100/100W) steels, or when holes exceed 1% inch in diameter
	- $= 0.15$ for all other steels and when holes are less than or equal to 1% inch in diameter.
- A_e = gross area of the member
- NET SECTION OF TENSION MEMBERS 1.7_z

Connection <member connection type><effective area deduction> Subcommand

LRFR

According to AASHTO LRFD Article 6.8.3.

$6.8.3$ Net Area

The net area, A_n , of an element is the product of the thickness of the element and its smallest net width. The width of each standard bolt hole shall be taken as the nominal diameter of the hole. The width of oversize and slotted holes, where permitted for use in Article 6.13.2.4.1, shall be taken as the nominal diameter or width of the hole, as applicable, specified in Article 6.13.2.4.2. The net width shall be determined for each chain of holes extending across the member or element along any transverse, diagonal, or zigzag line.

Tension Capacity

LFR

Method of solution 1.6.1

LRFR

According to Article 6.8.3.

1.6.1 Tension Capacity

Tension capacity is calculated using the following equation.

Max. Axial Tension Capacity = $A_{NET}F_Y$

Where,

= Net Area of the member cross section ANET

 F_Y = Yield stress of the steel

Tensile Resistance, Pr 6.8.2

$$
P_r = \min \left[\phi_y P_{ny} = \phi_y F_y A_g
$$

\n
$$
\phi_u P_{nu} = \phi_u F_u A_n R_p U
$$

\n(6.8.2.1-2)
\n(6.8.2.1-2)
\n(6.8.2.1-2)
\n(6.13.4-1)

- **BrR uses the same area for both LFR & LRFR method.**
- **Future Enhancement?**

Capacity

LFD Rating Comparison BrR Versus AASHTO

LFR

Sample bridge Truss without counter

MemberCrossSection ChannelBox = BC //Bottom Chord Channels "C 15x50" Inward 12.1875 A588 Connection Bolted 4.565 //6 - 1-1/16" Bolt Holes in web

Capacity

LFD Rating Comparison BrR Versus AASHTO

LFR

BrR Rating calculation

According to AASHTO Standard Article 10.18.4

Steel Channel Box - Truss Member BC1 - Start

Effective Area Deduction, Aeff = 4.5650 (in²2) SUMMARY:

Net Area, Anet = Agross-Aeff = 24.8350 (in²2) Allowable Tension, Pu = $Fy*$ Anet = 1241.7500 (kip)

PDL (Axial Dead Load) = 74.7362 (kip)

Compression Capacity

LFR

- Method of solution 1.6.2
- **AASHTO 10.54.1**

 $P_{\rm u} = 0.85 A_{\rm s} F_{\rm cr}$ $(10-150)$

where A_s is the gross effective area of the column cross section and F_{cr} is determined by one of the following two formulas*:

$$
F_{cr} = F_y \left[1 - \frac{F_y}{4\pi^2 E} \left(\frac{KL_c}{r} \right)^2 \right] \quad (10-151)
$$

for
$$
\frac{KL_c}{r} \le \sqrt{\frac{2\pi^2 E}{F_y}}
$$
 (10-152)

$$
F_{cr} = \frac{\pi^2 E}{\left(\frac{KL_c}{r} \right)^2}
$$
 (10-153)
for
$$
\frac{KL_c}{r} > \sqrt{\frac{2\pi^2 E}{F_y}}
$$
 (10-154)

LRFR

According to Article 6.9.4.1

• If $\frac{P_e}{P_o} \ge 0.44$, then:

$$
P_n = \left| 0.658 \frac{P_o}{P_e} \right| P_o \tag{6.9.4.1.1-1}
$$

• If
$$
\frac{P_e}{P_o} < 0.44
$$
, then:

- $P_n = 0.877 P_e$ $(6.9.4.1.1-2)$
- **No deviation from the code or discrepancies.**

LFR

- Method of solution 1.6.3
- AASHTO 10.54.1

1.6.3 Moment Capacity

Moment capacity is calculated using the following equation

$Mu = F_{Y}S$

Where,

 $Mu =$ Moment Capacity

- F_Y = Yield stress of the steel
- $S =$ The elastic section modulus corresponding to the bending axis

• **BrR does not identify capacity based on section type as opposed to current AASHTO and AASHTO 1995**.

LRFR

- According to Article 6.12.1.2
- Method of solution page A-12
- **Capacity varies by section type**
- W section
- Weak & Strong axis

LFR

10.48.1 Compact Sections

Sections of properly braced constant-depth flexural members without longitudinal web stiffeners, without holes in the tension flange and with high resistance to local buckling qualify as compact sections.

Sections of rolled or fabricated flexural members meeting the requirements of Article 10.48.1.1 below shall be considered compact sections and the maximum strength shall be computed as

> $M_u = F_v Z$ $(10-92)$

LFR

10.48.2 Braced Noncompact Sections

For sections of rolled or fabricated flexural members not meeting the requirements of Article 10.48.1.1 but meeting the requirements of Article 10.48.2.1 below, the maximum strength shall be computed as the lesser of

> $M_u = F_v S_{xt}$ $(10-98)$

or

$$
\mathbf{M}_{\mathsf{u}} = \mathbf{F}_{\mathsf{cr}} \mathbf{S}_{\mathsf{xc}} \mathbf{R}_{\mathsf{b}} \tag{10-99}
$$

subject to the requirement of Article 10.48.2.1(c) where

$$
F_{cr} = \left(4,400\frac{t}{b}\right)^2 \le F_y
$$

- $b =$ compression flange width
- $t =$ compression flange thickness
- S_{xt} = section modulus with respect to tension flange $(in.³)$
- S_{xc} = section modulus with respect to compression flange $(in.^3)$
- R_b = flange-stress reduction factor determined from the provisions of Article 10.48.4.1, with f_b substituted for the term M_r/S_{xc} when Equation (10-103b) applies

LRFR

Strong axis

$$
M_{rx} = \min(\phi_f F_{nc} S_{xc}, \phi_f F_{nt} S_{xt})
$$
 (c6.8.2.3-1)

LFR

AASHTO 1995

where:

- A_{∞} = Gross Effective Area
- F_{cr} = Critical Load per AASHTO, Article 10.54.1.1 with a Suitable Effective Length Factor, K.
- $C =$ Equivalent Moment Factor Taken as 0.85 or 1.00 as Appropriate
- = $(.85) (\pi^2) (E) / (KL/r)^2$ in Plane of Bending Е.
- $M_n = (F_n) (f) (S_m)$
- S_m = Section Modulus Reduced for Access Holes, if any
- M_u = Maximum Bending Strength, Reduced for Lateral Buckling as Indicated Herein

The bending strength of truss members shall be computed using the equations given below:

(A) For Box-Shaped Members:

$$
M_{\alpha} = F_{y} S_{\text{ps}} \left[1 - 0.0641 \frac{F_{y} S_{\text{ps}} L \sqrt{\Sigma(s/t)}}{E A \sqrt{I_{y}}} \right]
$$

where:

- $A = Area$ Enclosed Within Centerlines of Plates of **Box Members**
- st = Length of a Side Divided by its Thickness
- I_y = Moment of Inertia About the Axis Perpendicular to the Bending Axis

L $=$ Length of Member

S_ = Gross Effective Section Modulus About Bending Axis

The capacity of compression members shall be evaluated using the two interaction equations given below:

(B) For H-Shaped Members Bent About Their Minor Axis:

$$
M_u = 1.5 F_y S_{gg}
$$

(C) For H-Shaped Members, and Members with Channel Flanges and a Web Plate, Bent About Their **Major Axis:**

if
$$
\sigma_{\text{cr}} \le 0.5
$$
 F_y, $M_{\text{u}} = \sigma_{\text{cr}} S_{\text{gs}}$
\nif $\sigma_{\text{cr}} > 0.5$ F_y, $M_{\text{u}} = F_y S_{\text{gs}} \left[1 - \frac{F_y}{4 \sigma_{\text{cr}}} \right]$
\n
$$
\sigma_{\text{cr}} = \frac{1}{S_{\text{gs}}} \sqrt{\frac{\pi^2}{\text{ ELy}} \frac{\text{ELy}}{\text{KL}^2} + \frac{\pi^4 h^2 L_y^2 E^2}{4(\text{KL})^4}}
$$

where:

 $S_{\text{ex}} = Gross$ Effective Section Modulus About Bending Axis

Combined Tension and Flexure

LFR

• Method of solution 1.8.2 Tension members are only rated for

concentric axial force.

1.8 COMPUTATION OF MEMBER CAPACITY

The capacity of tension members shall be evaluated using the two interaction equations given below:

$$
\frac{P}{\left(\overline{F}_y\right)(A_u)} + \frac{M}{\left(\overline{S}_u\right)\left(\overline{F}_y\right)(f)} \le 1.0
$$

$$
\frac{P}{\left(\overline{F}_u\right)(A_{\overline{u}})} + \frac{M}{\left(\overline{S}_{\overline{u}}\right)\left(\overline{F}_u\right)(f)} \le 1.0
$$

where:

- = Factored Axial Load P
- F. \equiv Yield Point
- $=$ Net Area--Per Section 1.7 Herein
- $M =$ Factored Dead Load Moment
- = Net Section Modulus-Per Section 1.7 Herein s.
- $f =$ Plastic Shape Factor Computed on the basis of Gross or Gross Effective Properties
- $F_{\rm u}$ = Ultimate Strength of Steel
- A_{ii} = Net Area with All Holes Removed
- S_{ii} = Net Section Modulas wth All Holes Removed

• **AASHTO 1995 shows combined tension and Flexure.**

LRFR

Method of solution flow chart

6.8.2.3-Combined Tension and Flexure

A component subjected to tension and flexure shall satisfy Eq. 6.8.2.3-1 or 6.8.2.3-2.

If
$$
\frac{P_u}{P_r} < 0.2
$$
, then
\n
$$
\frac{P_u}{2.0 P_r} + \left(\frac{M_{ux}}{M_{rx}} + \frac{M_{uy}}{M_{ry}}\right) \le 1.0
$$
\n(6.8.2.3-1)

If
$$
\frac{P_u}{P_r} \ge 0.2
$$
, then
\n $\frac{P_u}{P_r} + \frac{8.0}{9.0} \left(\frac{M_{ux}}{M_{rx}} + \frac{M_{uy}}{M_{ry}} \right) \le 1.0$ (6.8.2.3-2)

Combined Compression and Flexure

LFR

- Method of solution 1.8.2
- **AASHTO Article 10.54.2**

10.54.2 Combined Axial Load and Bending 10.54.2.1 Maximum Capacity

The combined maximum axial force P and the maximum bending moment M acting on a beam-column subjected to eccentric loading shall satisfy the following equations:

$$
\frac{P}{0.85A_{4}F_{cr}} + \frac{MC}{M_{q}\left(1 - \frac{P}{A_{3}F_{g}}\right)} \le 1.0 \quad (10-155)
$$

$$
\frac{P}{0.85A_{4}F_{3}} + \frac{M}{M_{p}} \le 1.0 \quad (10-156)
$$

LRFR

- **Method of solution flow chart.**
- **AASHTO Article 6.4.2**

$$
\frac{P_u}{P_r} + \frac{M_{ux}}{M_{rx}} + \frac{M_{uy}}{M_{ry}} \le 1.0
$$

• **No deviation from the code or discrepancies.**

Concentric Axial Rating

LFR

- Method of solution 1.8.1
- Rating without adjacent vehicle
- **Rating with adjacent vehicle**

$$
RF = \frac{C - (A_1 D)}{A_2 L (1 + I) \alpha \beta}
$$

$$
RF = \frac{C - \left(A_1 D\right) - \left(A_2 L_2 \left(1 + I\right) \alpha_2\right)}{A_2 L_1 \left(1 + I\right) \alpha_1 \beta}
$$

LRFR

- Method of solution flow chart.
- Rating without adjacent vehicle only.

$$
RF = \frac{\varphi_c \varphi_s P_r - \gamma_{DC} P_{DC} - \gamma_{DW} P_{DW}}{\lambda_{LL} P_{LL+IM}}
$$

Pr is the factored tensile resistance or the factored compression resistance. Angles are only rated for tension and compression regardless of their end connections. As per C6.12.2.2.6, flexure due to eccentric axial tension is addressed through the shear lag coefficient, U. Flexure due to eccentric axial compression is taken into account by 6.9.4.4.

- **BrR does not include the effect of adjacent vehicle for LRFR.**
- **Future Enhancement?**

LFR

- Method of solution flow chart
- **Compression & Bending**

LRFR

- Method of solution flow chart.
- Compression & Bending
- \bullet δ_b in both x and y direction

Sample Bridge:

From 10-155:

Mem U1U2

LRFR

Input:

Fixity Start Y

Fixity Start Z

Condition Factor

Fixity End Y

Fixity End Z

System Factor

Phi F

Phi K

DC Axial

DW Axial

DC Moment Y

DW Moment Y

DC Moment Z

DW Moment Z

 $=$

 $=$

 \equiv

 $=$

Limit State: Vehicle:

Stage: 3 Flex Sense: N/A

6A Load and Resistance Factor Rating 64.6 Steel Structures 6A.6.8 Truss Combined Axial and Flexure Rating (AASHTO Manual for Bridge Evaluation, Third Edition with 2019 Interims)

Fixed

1.000

1.000

1.000

1.000

 $= -34.675$ (kip)

-8.248 (kip)

 $= 0.000 (kip-fit)$

 $= -0.292$ (kip-ft)

0.000 (kip-ft)

Steel Angle Box - Truss Member U1U2 - Start Stage 3 Load Limit ---------------- Capacity Override -----------------Combo State Pr Mrz Mrv MznPhi MznOvr Load PnPhi PnOvr MynPhi MynOvr Note $(kip-ft)$ (kip-ft) (kip-ft) (kip-ft) $(kip - ft)$ $(kip-ft)$ $STR-I$ Unsupported Length $Y = 192,000$ (in) LegalRout~ ¹ Unsupported Length Z = $192,000$ (in) LegalRout~ $STR-T$ -78.82 117.16 1 -359.19 Fixed * Moments are zero, therefore, load case handled by axial only article. Fixed Fixed

* Moments are zero, therefore, load case handled by axial only article.

- **BrR does not include the effect of flexure when calculating rating as opposed method of solution.**
- **Future Enhancement or Bug?**

LRFR

Eccentric Axial Rating: Tension & Bending

LFR

■ Method of solution flow chart

• Method of solution flow chart.

N.A

Future enhancement or clarification

LFR

- **Tension capacity needs improvement. As a** workaround capacity should be manually calculated and override to improve rating.
- Flexural capacity should be improved, or reason should be provided in the method of solution for deviating from AASHTO.
- **Method of solution for Truss force effect** with counter should be clarified.

LRFR

- BrR considers MPF=1.2 for single lane bridge as a default.
- **BrR** does not consider the effect of adjacent vehicle when performing rating.
- **Method of solution for Truss force effect** with counter should be clarified.
- BrR does not calculate rating factor for combined flexure and bending rating.